

Vanessa Andreotti Soft vs Critical Global Citizenship

	Soft Global Citizenship Education	Critical Global Citizenship Education
Problem	Poverty, helplessness	Inequality, injustice
Nature of the problem	Lack of 'development', education, resources, skills, culture, technology, etc.	Complex structures, systems, assumptions, power relations and attitudes that create and maintain exploitation and enforced disempowerment and tend to eliminate difference.
Justification for positions of privilege (North and South)	'Development', 'history', education, harder work, better organisation, better use of resources, technology.	Benefit from and control over unjust and violent systems and structures.
Basis for caring	Common humanity/being good/sharing and caring. Responsibility <i>FOR</i> the other (or <i>to teach</i> the other).	Justice/complicity in harm. Responsibility <i>TOWARDS</i> the other (or <i>to learn with</i> the other) - accountability.
Grounds for acting	Humanitarian/moral (based on normative principles for thought and action).	Political/ethical (based on normative principles for relationships).
Understanding of interdependence	We are all equally interconnected, we all want the same thing, we can all do the same thing.	Asymmetrical globalisation, unequal power relations, Northern and Southern elites imposing own assumptions as universal.
What needs to change	Structures, institutions and individuals that are a barrier to development.	Structures, (belief) systems, institutions, assumptions, cultures, individuals, relationships.
What for	So that everyone achieves development, harmony, tolerance and equality.	So that injustices are addressed, more equal grounds for dialogue are created, and people can have more autonomy to define their own development.
Role of 'ordinary' individuals	Some individuals are part of the problem, but ordinary people are part of the solution as they can create pressure to change structures.	We are all part of problem and part of the solution.
What individuals can do	Support campaigns to change structures, donate time, expertise and resources.	Analyse own position/context and participate in changing structures, assumptions, identities, attitudes and power relations in their contexts.
How does change happen	From the outside to the inside (imposed change).	From the inside to the outside.
Basic principle for change	Universalism (non-negotiable vision of how everyone should live what everyone should want or should be).	Reflexivity, dialogue, contingency and an ethical relation to difference (radical alterity).
Goal of global citizenship education	Empower individuals to act (or become active citizens) according to what has been defined for them as a good life or ideal world.	Empower individuals to reflect critically on the legacies and processes of their cultures, to imagine different futures and to take responsibility for decisions and actions.
Strategies for global citizenship education	Raising awareness of global issues and promoting campaigns.	Promoting engagement with global issues and perspectives and an ethical relationship to difference, addressing complexity and power relations.
Potential benefits of global citizenship education	Greater awareness of some of the problems, support for campaigns, greater motivation to help/do something, feel good factor.	Independent/critical thinking and more informed, responsible and ethical action.
Potential problems	Feeling of self-importance and self-righteousness and/or cultural supremacy, reinforcement of colonial assumptions and relations, reinforcement of privilege, partial alienation, uncritical action.	Guilt, internal conflict and paralysis, critical disengagement, feeling of helplessness.